Russian National Security Policy

Harvard Kennedy School | Fall 2023

WHERE & WHEN

LITTAUER 230 (HKS) TuTh 0900-1015

WHO

YURI M. ZHUKOV

Visiting Assoc Prof of Public Policy Harvard Kennedy School (2023-24)

Associate Professor School of Foreign Service Department of Government Georgetown University

CONTACT

email: yzhukov@hks.harvard.edu website: zhukovyuri.github.io

OFFICE HOURS

Tu 1500-1800 (via Zoom) Signup sheet (24 hours in advance): calendly.com/zhukov-hks

QUICK LINKS

COURSE CANVAS PAGE canvas.harvard.edu/courses/125757

READINGS

- .../files/folder/Readings LECTURE SLIDES
- .../files/folder/Slides ASSIGNMENTS
- .../files/folder/GroupActivity1
- .../files/folder/GroupActivity2
- .../files/folder/FinalProject

Note: No textbook purchases or journal subscriptions/licenses needed. All assigned readings (incl. recommended readings) will be available to enrolled students in PDF format via the course Canvas page.

WHAT

COURSE DESCRIPTION

This course seeks to explain the design and implementation of national security and defense policy in the Russian Federation and its predecessor states (Soviet Union, Russian Empire).

The lectures and readings are organized into three modules, focusing on how Russia has approached the competing challenges of (1) economic development, (2) internal security, and (3) relations with other actors in the international system.

Our attention will be on the interaction between these policy domains over different periods of Russian history — Tsarist, Soviet, and contemporary — with an emphasis on how the legacy of the past has shaped and constrained Russian national security strategy and decision-making.

Topics we will cover include: territorial and imperial expansion, serfdom, collectivization, industrialization, mass repression, counter-insurgency, military doctrine and organization, nuclear weapons, energy and natural resources, cyber warfare, and Russia's invasion of Ukraine.

Course readings will draw on literature from various disciplines, including political science, economics, history, and public policy. Class meetings will place a heavy emphasis on student participation and activity-based learning through surveys, games, simulations and debates.

GOALS

The learning objectives are twofold. The first is to equip students with the substantive background needed to follow contemporary policy debates surrounding Russia, and to place these debates in historical, political and economic context. The second is to equip students with the methodological tools needed to critically assess and contribute to these debates, and to locate the data and primary sources needed for such analyses.

PREREQUISITES

This course has no formal prerequisites.

Students with basic knowledge of Russian history or coursework in an introductory class on international relations, comparative politics or macroeconomics will have a slight advantage. Prior coursework in statistics and/or game theory will also helpful in digesting some of the assigned readings. However, students are not expected to have quantitative skills, Russian language proficiency, or prior area expertise to enroll in the course.

Those who want additional background in Russian history or political economy should consult the recommended readings listed in this syllabus.

FORMAT

The course is organized into two 75-minute meetings per week. Meetings will feature a combination of lectures, discussion and activity-based learning through participation in interactive debates and simulations.

COURSE POLICIES

ACADEMIC INTEGRITY

Students are expected to:

- ✓ Follow HKS Academic Code as specified in Student Handbook (tinyurl.com/hkshandbook).
- ✓ Properly cite books, articles, websites, lectures, datasets, and other sources in written work.

This is especially important for:

- Text taken, in whole or in part, from writing/speech published elsewhere.
- Arguments/insights drawn from writing/speech published elsewhere.
- ✓ Contribute fully to group activities and not "free ride" on the work of teammates.

Students are encouraged to:

- ✓ Collaborate on a co-authored final project or paper.
- ✓ Consult with classmates on choice of project topics and share sources.
- ✓ Use the final project as an opportunity to further develop ideas for an existing paper or thesis (w/ instructor approval).

GRADES

Grades will be based on class attendance/participation (30%), two group activities (15% + 15%), and a final individual project (40%).

The group activities will entail: (1) a class debate, focusing on strategies of external support for opposition groups inside Russia, (2) a crisis simulation, focusing on a hypothetical Russian military action against a NATO country.

For Masters-level students (MPP, MPA), the final project can take one of two forms: (1) a 10-15 page policy analysis paper (e.g. strategy/program evaluation, force balance or posture analysis, lessons learned from combat operations); or (2) the collection of a new dataset (e.g. on military units, operations or weapons systems, agency budgets or investments, arrests and other repressive activities, war crimes and atrocities).

For Ph.D. students, the final project will be an article-length empirical research paper (6,000-8,000 words).

Details on requirements and expectations for each assignment will be provided in mid-October. The project is due (via Canvas) on December 7.

USE OF GENERATIVE AI FOR COURSEWORK

Generative Artificial Intelligence (AI) is a powerful new tool for learning and discovery. It can be difficult to fully grasp AI's potential impact on students' future careers, but this technology clearly has the potential to increase productivity in certain domains. As a pedagogical tool for developing students' critical thinking and skills, however, AI cannot substitute the value of working through course assignments and readings on one's own.

This course will follow HKS's general policy on students' use of generative Al for coursework: it's OK to use this technology as a tool to look up information, but not OK to use Al to complete assignments. Specifically,

- 1. It is generally acceptable to use generative AI for finding information and for solidifying knowledge of the course content. For instance, it is fine to use AI-powered web search and to have "conversations" with tools like ChatGPT to help explore ideas, refine one's thinking, identify examples, and better understand the course material. However, unless otherwise specified, it is a violation of the HKS Academic Code to incorporate into one's coursework text produced predominantly by generative AI similar to copying from a book or article. For example, it would be inappropriate to simply rewrite a draft generated by AI.
- 2. Generative AI can produce false or misleading information. Students are ultimately responsible for the accuracy of any work they submit. Any facts that students look up using AI chatbots (as with any other online source) should be verified and properly cited with a second, authoritative source (e.g. primary document, news story, academic article or book, administrative records, reference volume). As a general rule of thumb, when looking up information, AI is a good place to start, but the wrong place to end (much like Wikipedia).
- 3. If students have any doubt about whether a specific use of generative AI is permitted for an assignment or course, they should discuss it with the course instructor prior to using it.

IMPORTANT DATES

CLASS SCHEDULE

COURSE BEGINS

Thursday, Aug. 31

INTRODUCTION

0. **Russia in 2023** Thursday, Aug 31

• Kofman, M. 2021. "Continuity and Change in Russian Grand Strategy." In N. Monteiro & F. Bartel (Eds.), Before and After the Fall: World Politics and the End of the Cold War (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press): pp. 169-187.

Recommended:

- Ziegler, C.E. 2018. "Diplomacy." In Tsygankov, A.P. (Ed.) Routledge handbook of Russian foreign policy (Routledge): pp. 123-137.
- Strokan, M.A. and Taylor, B.A. 2018. "Intelligence." In Tsygankov, A.P. (Ed.) *Routledge handbook of Russian foreign policy* (Routledge): pp. 153-167.
- Konyshev, V. and Sergunin, A. 2018. "Military." In Tsygankov, A.P. (Ed.) *Routledge handbook of Russian foreign policy* (Routledge): pp. 168-181.
- 1. Backgrounder: National Security Policy Analysis Tuesday, Sep 5
 - Kugler, R.L., 2006. *Policy Analysis in National Security Affairs: New Methods for a New Era* (Washington, DC: National Defense University Press): pp. 13-24.

Recommended:

• Kugler, R.L., 2006. *Policy Analysis in National Security Affairs: New Methods for a New Era* (Washington, DC: National Defense University Press): pp. 35-84, 215-252.

ECONOMIC FOUNDATIONS OF RUSSIAN NATIONAL SECURITY

- 2. Land, Labor, and Serfdom Thursday, Sep 7
 - Stanziani, A. 2008. "Serfs, slaves, or wage earners? The legal status of labour in Russia from a comparative perspective, from the sixteenth to the nineteenth century." *Journal of Global History*, 3(2): pp. 183-202.

Recommended:

- Domar, E. D. 1970. "The causes of slavery or serfdom: a hypothesis." *The Journal of Economic History*, 30(1): pp. 18-32.
- Buggle, J.C. and Nafziger, S., 2021. "The slow road from serfdom: labor coercion and long-run development in the former Russian Empire." *Review of Economics and Statistics*, 103(1): pp. 1-17.
- Rudolph, R. L. 1985. "Agricultural structure and proto-industrialization in Russia: economic development with unfree labor." *Journal of Economic History*, 45(1): pp. 47-69.
- 3. Colonial Expansion and an Unstable Frontier Tuesday, Sep 12
 - Sunderland, W. 2006. Taming the wild field: colonization and empire on the Russian steppe. (Cornell University Press): pp. 1-35.

Recommended:

COURSE ADD DEADLINE

Friday, Sep. 8

COURSE DROP DEADLINE

(WITHOUT NOTATION)

Thursday, Sep. 14

•	Etkind, A. 2015. "How Russia 'colonized itself': Internal
	colonization in classical Russian historiography." International
	Journal for History. Culture and Modernity 3(2): pp.159-172.

- Gammer, M. 2003. Muslim resistance to the Tsar: Shamil and the conquest of Chechnia and Daghestan. (Taylor and Francis): pp. 1-26.
- Morozov, V., 2013. "Subaltern empire? Toward a postcolonial approach to Russian foreign policy." *Problems of Post-Communism*, 60(6): pp. 16-28.

4. The Seeds of Revolution Thursday, Sep 14

• Pipes, R. 1994. "Did the Russian Revolution Have to Happen?" American Scholar 63 (2): 215-238.

Recommended:

- Geifman, A. 1995. Thou Shalt Kill: Revolutionary Terrorism in Russia; 1894-1917. (Princeton University Press): Chapter 1.
- Skocpol, T. 1976. "France, Russia, China: A structural analysis of social revolutions." *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 18(2): pp. 175-210.
- Talibova, R. 2021. "Repression, Military Service and Insurrection." Working paper.

 Allen, R. C. 2003. From Farm to Factory: A Reinterpretation of the Soviet Industrial Revolution. Princeton: Princeton University Press. Chapters 2-4.

Recommended:

- Bandera, V. N. 1963. "The New Economic Policy (NEP) as an Economic System." *The Journal of Political Economy*, 71(3): pp. 265-279.
- Gregory, P.R., and Tikhonov, A. 2000. "Central Planning and Unintended Consequences: Creating the Soviet Financial System, 1930-1939." *Journal of Economic History* 60 (4): pp. 1017-1040.
- Johnson, S., and Temin, P. 1993. "The macroeconomics of NEP." *The Economic History Review*, 46(4): pp. 750-767.

6. Collectivization, Industrialization, Famine Thursday, Sep 21

- Allen, R. C. 2003. From Farm to Factory: A Reinterpretation of the Soviet Industrial Revolution. Princeton: Princeton University Press. Chapter 5.
- Snyder, T. 2012. Bloodlands: Europe Between Hitler and Stalin. (Basic Books): Chapter 1.

- Millar, J. R. 1974. "Mass collectivization and the contribution of Soviet agriculture to the First Five-Year Plan: A review article." Slavic Review, 33(4): pp. 750-766.
- Rosefielde, S. 1983. "Excess mortality in the Soviet Union: A reconsideration of the demographic consequences of forced industrialization 1929-1949." *Europe-Asia Studies*, 35(3): pp. 385-409.

• Naumenko, N. 2021. "The political economy of famine: The Ukrainian famine of 1933." *The Journal of Economic History* 81(1): pp.156-197.

7. Forced Labor and the Gulag Tuesday, Sep 26

• Gregory, P.R. 2002. "An Introduction to the Economics of the Gulag." In Gregory, P.R. and Lazarev, V. (Eds.) *The Economics of Forced Labor: The Soviet Gulag* (Hoover Institution Press): pp. 1-22.

Recommended:

- Khlevnyuk, O.V. 2013. "The Economy of the Gulag." In Gregory, P. (Ed.) Behind the Façade of Stalin's Command Economy: Evidence from the State and Party Archives (Hoover Institution Press).
- Sokolov, A. 2003. "Forced Labor in Soviet Industry: The End of the 1930s to the Mid-1950s." In Gregory, P.R. and Lazarev, V. (Eds.) *The Economics of Forced Labor: The Soviet Gulag* (Hoover Institution Press): pp. 23-42.
- Miller, M. and Smith, J.C. 2015. "In the shadow of the Gulag: Worker discipline under Stalin." *Journal of Comparative Economics* 43(3): pp.531-548.

INTERNAL SECURITY AND REPRESSION

GROUP ACTIVITY 1

STUDENTS RECEIVE ASSIGNMENT Thursday, Sep. 28

- 8. Backgrounder: Repression......Thursday, Sep 28
 - Zhukov, Y.M. 2023. "Repression Works (Just Not in Moderation)." *Comparative Political Studies* 56(11): pp. 1663-1694.

Recommended:

- Davenport, C. 2007. "State repression and political order." Annual Review of Political Science 10: pp. 1-23.
- Hill, D.W. and Jones, Z.M. 2014. "An empirical evaluation of explanations for state repression." *American Political Science Review* 108(3): pp. 661-687.
- Soldatov, A. and Borogan, I. 2013. "Russia's surveillance state." World Policy Journal 30(3): pp. 23-30.
- 9. Insurgency and Counter-Insurgency Tuesday, Oct 3
 - Kramer, M. 2004. "The perils of counterinsurgency: Russia's war in Chechnya." *International Security* 29 (3): pp. 5-63.

- Burds, J. 1997. "AGENTURA: Soviet Informants' Networks & the Ukrainian Rebel Underground in Galicia, 1944-1948," *East European Politics and Societies* 11, no. 1 (Winter): 89-130.
- Statiev, A. 2010. The Soviet Counterinsurgency in the Western Borderlands. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press): Chapters 1-3.
- Zhukov, Y.M. 2015. "Population Resettlement in War: Theory and Evidence from Soviet Archives." *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 59(7): pp. 1155-1185.

10. Sta	te Security Services
•	Soldatov, A. and Borogan, I. 2010. "Russia's New Nobility-The Rise of the Security Services in Putin's Kremlin." <i>Foreign Affairs</i> 89(5):pp. 80-96.
Rec	commended:
•	Gregory, P.R. 2009. "Simplified methods and efficiency: Stalin's terror managers." <i>Journal of Comparative Economics</i> 37(2): pp. 207-216.
•	Gregory, P.R., Schröder, P.J., and Sonin, K. 2011. "Rational dictators and the killing of innocents: Data from Stalin's archives." <i>Journal of Comparative Economics</i> , 39(1): pp. 34-42.
•	Snyder, T. 2012. Bloodlands: Europe Between Hitler and Stalin. (Basic Books): Chapters 2-3.
11. The	Long-Term Legacy of Violence Tuesday, Oct 10
•	Rozenas, A. and Zhukov, Y.M. 2019. "Mass Repression and Political Loyalty: Evidence from Stalin's 'Terror by Hunger'." American Political Science Review 133(2): pp. 569-583.
Rec	commended:
•	Lupu, N. and Peisakhin, L., 2017. "The legacy of political violence across generations." <i>American Journal of Political Science</i> 61(4): pp. 836-851.
•	Rozenas, A., Schutte, S., and Zhukov, Y.M. 2017. "The Political Legacy of Violence: The Long-Term Impact of Stalin's Repression in Ukraine." <i>Journal of Politics</i> 79(4): pp. 1147-1161.
•	Rozenas, A., Talibova, R., and Zhukov, Y.M. 2023. "Fighting for Tyranny: State Repression and Combat Motivation." <i>American Economic Journal: Applied Economics</i> (forthcoming).
12. Gr c	oup Activity 1Thursday, Oct 12
RUSSIA	N FOREIGN AND DEFENSE POLICY
13. Bac	Ekgrounder: Military Analysis Tuesday, Oct 17
•	Dunnigan, J.F. 2003. How to Make War: A Comprehensive Guide to Modern Warfare in the Twenty-First Century, 4th ed. (New York: Quill): Ch. 1.
Rec	commended:
•	Biddle, S. 2004. Military Power: Explaining Victory and Defeat in Modern Battle (Princeton: Princeton University Press): pp. 1-51. House, J.M. 2001. Combined Arms Warfare in the Twentieth Century (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2001): pp. 31-64. Stumborg M.E. Blasius T.D. Full S.L. and Hughes C.A. 2022.

GROUP ACTIVITY 1 IN-CLASS DEBATE

Thursday, Oct. 12

FINAL PROJECT

STUDENTS RECEIVE ASSIGNMENT Tuesday, Oct. 17

- Stumborg, M.F., Blasius, T.D., Full, S.J., and Hughes, C.A. 2022. Goodhart's Law: Recognizing and Mitigating the Manipulation of Measures in Analysis (Center for Naval Analyses)
- 14. USSR at War: Stalin's Bid for Strategic Depth Thursday, Oct 19
 - Overy, R. 1997. Russias War: A History of the Soviet War Effort, 1941-1945 (New York: Penguin, 1997): pp. 34-72.

FINAL PROJECT TOPIC SELECTIONS DUE Thursday, Oct. 26

• Snyder, T. 2012. Bloodlands: Europe Between Hitler and Stalin. (Basic Books): Chapter 4.

15. USSR at War: Barbarossa to Moscow......Tuesday, Oct 24

• Overy, R. 1997. Russias War: A History of the Soviet War Effort, 1941-1945 (New York: Penguin, 1997): pp. 73-124.

Recommended:

- Murray, W. and Millett, A.R. 2000. A War to Be Won: Fighting the Second World War (Cambridge: Harvard University Press): pp. 110-142.
- Overy, R. 1997. Russias War: A History of the Soviet War Effort, 1941-1945 (New York: Penguin, 1997): pp. 125-153.
- Snyder, T. 2012. Bloodlands: Europe Between Hitler and Stalin. (Basic Books): Chapters 5-6.

16. USSR at War: Stalingrad to Berlin Thursday, Oct 26

• Overy, R. 1997. Russias War: A History of the Soviet War Effort, 1941-1945 (New York: Penguin, 1997): pp. 154-185.

Recommended:

• Overy, R. 1997. Russias War: A History of the Soviet War Effort, 1941-1945 (New York: Penguin, 1997): pp. 186-222.

17. Origins of the Cold War......Tuesday, Oct 31

• Kennan, G.F. ('X'). 1947. "The sources of Soviet conduct." Foreign Affairs 25: pp. 566-582.

Recommended:

- Gaddis, J.L. 1986. "The long peace: Elements of stability in the postwar international system." *International Security* 10(4): pp. 99-142.
- Mastny, V. 1998. The Cold War and Soviet Insecurity: The Stalin Years (Oxford University Press): pp. 3-29.
- Odom, W.E. 1998. The collapse of the Soviet military (Yale University Press): pp. 16-37.

18. **Nuclear Weapons and Strategy** Thursday, Nov 2

• Nikitin, M.B.D. 2022. Russia's Nuclear Weapons: Doctrine, Forces, and Modernization (CRS Report R45861).

- Kofman, M., Fink, A. and Edmonds, J. 2020. Russian Strategy for Escalation Management: Evolution of Key Concepts (Center for Naval Analyses).
- Wohlstetter, A. 1959. "The Delicate Balance of Terror." *Foreign Affairs* 37: pp. 211-234.
- Powell, R. 2015. "Nuclear brinkmanship, limited war, and military power." *International Organization* 69(3): pp. 589-626.

19. Russian Military Strategy After the Soviet Collapse . . Tuesday, Nov 7

• Kofman, M., Fink, A., Gorenburg, D., Chesnut, M., Edmonds, J. and Waller, J. 2021. Russian Military Strategy: Core Tenets and Operational Concepts (Center for Naval Analyses).

Recommended:

- Golts, A.M. and Putnam, T.L. 2004. "State militarism and its legacies: Why military reform has failed in Russia." *International Security* 29(2): pp. 121-158.
- Makarychev, A. and Sergunin, A. 2013. "Russian military reform: institutional, political and security implications." *Defense and Security Analysis* 29(4): pp. 356-364.
- Reach, C., Demus, A., Grisé, M., Holynska, Kh., Lynch, C., Massicot, D. and Woodworth, D. 2023. Russia's Evolution Toward a Unified Strategic Operation: The Influence of Geography and Conventional Capacity (Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation).

20. Energy and Natural Resources Thursday, Nov 9

• Goldman, M.I. 2008. Petrostate: Putin, Power and the New Russia. (Oxford University Press, 2008): Chapter 6.

Recommended:

- Ross, M. L. 1999. "The political economy of the resource curse." World Politics, 51: 297-322.
- Volkov, V. 2008. "Standard Oil and Yukos in the Context of Early Capitalism in the United States and Russia," *Demokratizatsiya* 16 (3): pp. 240-264.
- Weinthal, E. and Luong, P.J. 2006. "Combating the resource curse: An alternative solution to managing mineral wealth." *Perspectives on politics* 4(1): pp. 35-53.

21. Information, Hybrid and Cyber Warfare.....Tuesday, Nov 14

 Radin, A., Demus, A. and Marcinek, K. 2020. Understanding Russian Subversion: Patterns, Threats, and Responses (Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation).

- Eady, G., Paskhalis, T., Zilinsky, J., Bonneau, R., Nagler, J. and Tucker, J.A. 2023. "Exposure to the Russian Internet Research Agency foreign influence campaign on Twitter in the 2016 US election and its relationship to attitudes and voting behavior." *Nature Communications* 14(62).
- Kostyuk, N. and Zhukov, Y.M. 2019. "Invisible Digital Front: Can Cyber Attacks Shape Battlefield Events?" *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 63(2): 317-347.
- Zeigler, S.M., Massicot, D., Treyger, E., Aoki, N., Sachs, C. and Watts, C. 2021. *Analysis of Russian Irregular Threats* (Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation).

GROUP ACTIVITY 2

STUDENTS RECEIVE ASSIGNMENT Thursday, Nov. 16

BRINGING IT ALL TOGETHER: RUSSIA'S INVASION OF UKRAINE

- 22. Backgrounder: Ukraine Thursday, Nov 16
 - Kuzio, T. 2023. "Why Western Scholars of Russia Were Unable to Understand Russia's Invasion of Ukraine." *Vox Ukraine* (17 July).

Recommended:

- Bowen, A.S. 2023. Ukrainian Military Performance and Outlook (CRS Report IF12150).
- Kolsto, P. 2023. "Ukrainians and Russians Are Not One People, But Perhaps Not for the Reasons You Think." PONARS Eurasia Policy Memo No. 842.
- Kulyk, V. 2022. "Overcoming the Colonial Perspective in Ukrainian Studies." APSA Comparative Politics 33(1): pp. 13-16.

COURSE DROP DEADLINE

(WITH NOTATION)
Tuesday, Nov. 21

- 23. Russian-Ukrainian War: 2014-2021 Tuesday, Nov 21
 - Kofman, M., Migacheva, K., Nichiporuk, B., Radin, R., Tkacheva, O. and Oberholtzer, J. 2017. Lessons from Russia's Operations in Crimea and Eastern Ukraine (Santa Monica: RAND).

Recommended:

- Rumer, E. and Weiss, A.S. 2021. "Ukraine: Putin's Unfinished Business," *Carnegie Endowment for International Peace*, November 12.
- Driscoll, J. and Steinert-Threlkeld, Z.C. 2020. "Social media and Russian territorial irredentism: some facts and a conjecture." *Post-Soviet Affairs* 36(2): 101-121.
- Zhukov, Y.M. 2016. "Trading Hard Hats for Combat Helmets: The Economics of Rebellion in Eastern Ukraine." *Journal of Comparative Economics* 44(1): pp. 1-15.
- 24. Russian-Ukrainian War: 2022- Tuesday, Nov 28
 - Watling, J. and Reynolds, N.. 2023. "Meatgrinder: Russian Tactics in the Second Year of Its Invasion of Ukraine." *RUSI Special Report*.

Recommended:

- Kofman, M. and Lee, R. 2022. "Not Built for Purpose: The Russian Military's III-Fated Force Design." *War on the Rocks* (June 2).
- Zabrodskyi, M., Watling, J., Danylyuk, O.V. and Reynolds, N. 2022. "Preliminary Lessons in Conventional Warfighting from Russia's Invasion of Ukraine: February–July 2022," *RUSI Special Report*: pp. 7-52.
- Zhukov, Y.M. 2023. "Near-real time analysis of war and economic activity during Russia's invasion of Ukraine." *Journal of Comparative Economics* (forthcoming).

GROUP ACTIVITY 2

IN-CLASS CRISIS SIMULATION Thursday, Nov. 30

FINAL PROJECT

PROJECTS DUE VIA CANVAS

Thursday, Dec. 7

25. **Group Activity 2** Thursday, Nov 30